



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

(1) the session of the Northwest territory to the United States and the organization and development of territorial government (1780-1816), (2) the organization of a constitutional government, (3) amendment of the constitution of 1816, (4) the constitutional convention of 1850, and (5) amendment of the constitution of 1851.

Stated in general terms, the two volumes really center about the two constitutions under which Indiana has been governed for one hundred years: the constitution of 1816 and that of 1851. These two constitutions are given in full with elaborate notes; but there was a long struggle in the attainment of each of these fundamental laws, and, when adopted, the questions of interpretation, of amendment, of repeal, and of carrying the instrument into effect formed an interesting history in state politics, and these phases are illustrated by appropriate documents in the shape of resolutions, debates, court opinions, and newspaper comments. Thus the history of political parties in Indiana and their relation to the national parties are set forth in orderly development giving an insight into the local forces that determined in a measure party action in the nation at large. While the period covered only aims to give the history of a century, the first document, the Northwest ordinance, is the starting point in that history and the work thus reflects the entire history of political parties in America as developed in one state. The fact that Indiana was one of the states carved out of the Northwest territory lends a special interest to the work, for aside from Ohio no state west of the Alleghanies has passed through a more interesting process of development. Here the ideas of the fathers of the constitution meet those of the pioneer; the models for the states of the great west are being formed here; indeed every phase of political life through which America has passed since the formation of the constitution is reflected, if not enacted, in the history of Indiana. Mr. Kettleborough has greatly enhanced the usefulness of this work by devoting 150 pages to a very thorough analytical index, especially useful since the original archives of the earlier sources quoted are without an index. The work is an important contribution to American political institutions.

KARL F. GEISER

History of the North Indiana conference of the Methodist Episcopal church. From its organization, in 1844, to the present. By H. N. Herrick, D.D., of the North Indiana conference, and William Warren Sweet, professor of history, DePauw university. (Indianapolis: W. K. Stewart company, 1917. 375 p. \$2.50)

The addition of one more to the extensive list of books dealing with local religious history would not ordinarily be expected to command at-

tention beyond the special locality or at most beyond the membership of the denomination to which it pertains. That it should do so in the present instance is unquestionably due to the fact that the name of a professional historian already identified with the history of the Methodist Episcopal church appears upon the title page. The share Mr. Sweet has had in the production of the volume is clearly set forth in the introduction. At the death of the veteran member of the North Indiana conference to whom the task had at first been confided, who had arranged a plan and had collected the major portion of the material, the duty of editing, supervising, and producing the book devolved upon Mr. Sweet. While thus assuming responsibility for the form and content of the volume he has relied upon the assistance of a group of historical students working under his direction, and only a few of the eleven chapters which compose the first part of the book are from his own pen. The second part containing well-arranged lists of appointment records which fill more than a third of the volume was practically completed by the original historical committee of the conference. Under these circumstances Mr. Sweet has not ventured to depart from the conventional method of recording religious history, and save for its more accurate documentation his work differs but little from other chronicles of religious denominations in the United States. His frank avowal that it is written for the gratification of "those who love the church of their fathers, whether they be laymen or ministers" rather than with intent "to excite the interest of the casual reader" sufficiently explains its scope and purpose.

Serious criticism might thus have been effectually disarmed were it not for the question raised in the opening chapter as to whether such a history is worth the writing. To this question there can be but one answer. In a country where religion has played so large a part in the formation of ideas, institutions, and character, the history of any single denomination and especially of one that has been so potent a factor as the Methodist Episcopal church is indispensable to a true understanding of national development. The only matter in doubt is the way in which such writings should be done.

From the standpoint of the historian there are two chronic defects which writers of religious history would do well to overcome in order that their work may prove to be of permanent value. The one concerns the selection and use of material; the other concerns the point of view, and of the two it is incomparably the more important. The limitation in the use of material which this book shares in common with a large majority of its predecessors is the tendency to rely almost exclusively upon what may be called the official documentary sources of one denomination. Only one manuscript is cited in the footnotes, and the informa-

tion in the text is chiefly drawn from reports of conference meetings and from the pages of the *Western christian advocate*. In consequence we find there much statistical information as to the membership of churches, the dimensions of church buildings, the furniture of parsonages, the payment of salaries, the number of converts at revivals and camp meetings, and the contributions of missionary societies, while there is comparatively little which reveals the part taken by the leaders of the Methodist Episcopal church in northern Indiana in the ordinary affairs of their day and generation; and although biographical sketches appear with the regularity of obituary notices in the official organ of the denomination the personality of individuals whose influence upon western life can scarcely be estimated still remains veiled. The result is a chronicle of facts not much more illuminating than the sources from which it is compiled.

The second defect is to a certain extent a logical result of this limited use of source material. On account of the peculiar relations between church and state in the United States the official utterances of religious denominations are guarded and reserved in the extreme. The evidence from these sources therefore can not be accepted as conclusive save for statistical facts. For the interpretation and understanding of these facts, it must be reinforced by the more intimate personal material found in diaries, letters, or sermons where a freer expression of individual feeling and a fuller discussion of problems affecting religious development were both safe and permissible. To illustrate by a case in point, the bare statement is made from time to time that Sunday services were held in a court house pending the completion of a church building, yet no hint is given of the efforts necessary to obtain permission to use a public building for religious purposes, nor of the hard feelings engendered where it was occupied by Methodists to the exclusion of Baptists, Catholics, or Presbyterians, who for the time being were likewise without a place of worship. Such facts indubitably more significant than the exact number of converts upon the particular occasion would be obviously out of place in records intended for immediate publication, yet they become abundantly clear in the manuscript sources and are corroborated by a glance at the history of rival denominations.

It appears certain, therefore, that a wider range of investigation leading to comparative study of the various sects in a given locality would result in an expansion of the point of view and would produce a truer historical perspective. Especially is this the case in the religious history of the northwest, where sectarian competition was at its keenest and where the political influence of the various denominations had to be taken into account. Granted that the history of other denominations

should be relegated to the background, it is nevertheless true that keeping the spotlight continually upon the activity of the Methodist Episcopal church in Indiana is apt to create the erroneous impression that its development went on apart from and uninfluenced by the forces which affected other denominations. That the author is cognizant of this sectarian interaction is shown in three brief though rather casual references, one noting the influence of Quaker example upon the questions of licensing women preachers, another mentioning Catholic competition after 1880, and a third which cites in a footnote the statistics of a few protestant denominations in 1906. As a matter of fact, however, Catholic expansion into the northwest had been regarded as a political and religious menace by many pious protestants even before the organization of the North Indiana conference in 1844, and in spite of the courteous intercourse between members of different faiths there were deep undercurrents of acrimonious feeling concerning the efforts of Methodists to increase their membership at the expense of other protestant denominations. To leave these facts out of account in writing a history of the Methodist Episcopal church is to present a partial and biased view of its development.

Still further expansion in the point of view would vastly improve the traditional method of writing religious history. If it be incontestably true that the story of one religious sect can not be portrayed apart from that of others existing in the same locality, it is equally beyond question that there is close interrelation between the development of the country as a whole and that of the various sects. Not only were the churches affected by the economic and political conditions of the country; they were also important factors in aiding or retarding that development. It would be interesting to know, for instance, just how the lands for churches and parsonages were originally acquired, whether by direct purchase from the government or from private owners, or, as was often the case, by donation from land speculators who were anxious to encourage settlement upon tracts in their possession. In either event the negotiations for the property would throw much light upon conditions of life in a frontier community where the church was the social as well as the religious center. The political influence exercised by religious associations, while difficult to estimate with precision, might also be detected by means of a thorough investigation of religious source material, and the inclusion of such topics would greatly enhance the permanent value of these studies in the local history of church organizations.

That the task of writing religious history from this enlarged point of view is far more complicated than compiling a chronicle of events from a narrower range of printed sources must be admitted, and there is rea-

son to doubt whether even the most liberal minded of religious sects would feel justified in financing such a narrative. Historical truth in its larger aspects then may not be feasible in a denominational study and accuracy of statement may only be possible when the record is limited to the obvious facts; yet if students in this unexplored field are to perform the service expected of them they must take into consideration on the one hand those subtle and potent forces of human personality and belief which explain the motive behind the event, while on the other hand they must view the subject of religions in the clearer light of political, social, and economic development. Otherwise the local sectarian history will remain in the future what it has been in the past, a convenient secondary source from which the religious history of the United States may some day be written. Meanwhile there is encouragement for the future in the increasing interest historians are showing in this particular field and in the fact that one of them has been able and willing to coöperate with religious leaders in the production of a study of unusual precision and accuracy.

MARTHA L. EDWARDS

Jahrbuch der Deutsch-Amerikanischen historischen Gesellschaft von Illinois. Herausgegeben von Dr. Julius Goebel, Professor an der Staatsuniversität zu Illinois. [Jahrgang, 1915, volume xv, im Auftrage der Deutch-Amerikanschen historischen Gesellchaft von Illinois] (Chicago: University of Chicago press, 1916. 382 p. \$3.00 net)

The present volume of the *Jahrbuch* is a distinct step in advance of the old method of treating ethnic elements of our population. Instead of being a mere collection of biographical sketches or annalistic accounts of the activity of the German-Americans in some field of endeavor, it is composed of carefully sifted articles consisting of source material, biographical sketches of prominent German-Americans, and contributions on the German-American activities and influence in some field with careful estimates of their influence on American activities in the same field.

In the source material we have two speeches of Karl Schurz and Franz Sigel edited by Mr. Goebel. These speeches, delivered in 1891, sound the same keynote of loyalty to their adopted country as is sounded in the utterances of many German-Americans of the present day. A letter of Paul Follen, the leader of the *Giessener Gesellschaft*, an unfortunate emigration society, pictures the hardships of the pioneers in Missouri. In the same class of material are the interesting "Recollections of a forty-eighter," by Frederick Behlendorff who presents a vivid picture of early civil war campaigns in Missouri. The last contribution in this class